



Council of the European Union  
General Secretariat

Central Library

**THINK TANK REVIEW**

**The Scottish  
Referendum**

**Special Issue**

**September 2014**

Dear Reader,

This special issue of the monthly Think Tank Review deals with articles about the Scottish Referendum on September 18, 2014. It provides a compilation of relevant articles from the past year that have been featured in past versions of the Council Library's review.

The current review and past issues can be downloaded from our EU Council [Library Blog](#). As always, feedback is welcome at [central.library@consilium.europa.eu](mailto:central.library@consilium.europa.eu).

The next Review will be out in October 2014, with papers published in September.

For readers from outside the General Secretariat, the Central Library is in the Justus Lipsius building, at JL 02 GH, Rue de la Loi 175, 1048 Brussels. It is open to Council officials, staff of other EU institutions and Permanent Representations of Member States. Members of the public may use the library for research purposes.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### From TTR Issue 1: February 2013

THE INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN AFFAIRS (IIAE)	
Untying the knot? Ireland, the UK and the EU .....	3

### From TTR Issue 6: July 2013

INSTITUTE FOR EUROPEAN STUDIES	
EU enlargement: lessons from, and prospects for .....	3

### From TTR Issue 9: November 2013

COLLEGE OF EUROPE	
Is independence possible in an interdependent world? Scotland vs. the UK's participation in the European economy .....	3

### From TTR Issue 11: March 2014

INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN AFFAIRS	
Scotland's vote on independence – The implications for Ireland .....	4

### From TTR Issue 14: June 2014

EUROPEAN POLICY CENTRE	
Could an independent Scotland join the European Union?.....	4
EUROPEAN POLICY CENTRE / BARCELONA CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS	
Independence and the European Union.....	4

### From TTR Issue 15: July 2014

INSTITUTE FOR FISCAL STUDIES	
Policies for an independent Scotland? Putting the independence White Paper in its fiscal context.....	5
Taxation, government spending and the public finances of Scotland: updating the medium-term outlook .....	5

### From TTR Issue 16 - September 2014

INSTITUTE FOR FISCAL STUDIES	
Taxing an independent Scotland.....	5
FONDATION ROBERT SCHUMAN	
Scotland's probable choice to remain part of the UK will not necessarily mean the end of the road to autonomy ...	5
ROYAL UNITED SERVICES INSTITUTE	
Relocation, relocation, relocation : could the UK's nuclear force be moved after Scottish independence? .....	5

***From TTR Issue 1: February 2013***

THE INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN AFFAIRS (IIAE)

**Untying the knot? Ireland, the UK and the EU**

by Dáithí O'Ceallaigh and James Kilcourse

14 February 2013

Link to the article in [English](#)

Ireland must stay close to both the UK and Europe, the IIAE argues. It is the crux of the challenge facing Ireland as the UK attempts to renegotiate its position in the European Union. "The relationship between Ireland and the UK has never been better, but David Cameron's January 2013 speech on Europe heralds a long period of uncertainty for Ireland and the EU." The uncertainty surrounding the UK's place in Europe is further intensified by the Scottish vote on independence in 2014. Given that it stands to be one of the biggest losers from a UK withdrawal. The paper notes that it's crucial that Ireland adopts a far-sighted and well-balanced strategy for dealing with the possible implications.

***From TTR Issue 6: July 2013***

INSTITUTE FOR EUROPEAN STUDIES

**EU enlargement: lessons from, and prospects for**

by Emmanuel Dalle Mulle, Gerben Wedekind, Inge Depoorter, Thomas Sattich and Tomas Maltby

June 2013

Link to the article in [English](#)

Focusing on climate and energy security policy, this paper first reflects upon the impact of the 2004/2007 enlargement on the EU. A reflection on the EU's recent past then follows, with a consideration that predictions of decision- and policy-making gridlock were not realised, that newer member states have proved influential, and that prospective member states cannot be expected to be passive nor impotent. The latter part of this paper evaluates the potential prospects and outcomes of these lessons with regard to future enlargement from within (Scotland and Catalonia), and without (Turkey).

***From TTR Issue 9: November 2013***

COLLEGE OF EUROPE

**Is independence possible in an interdependent world? Scotland vs. the UK's participation in the European economy**

by Andrew Hughes Hallett

October 2013

Link to the article in [English](#)

This lecture sets out to identify what level of autonomy or independence would best suit a regional economy in a currency union, and also the institutional changes needed to sustain those arrangements. The topics covered include the advantages of a fiscal federalism framework with the institutions needed to support it, and the main arguments for the breakup of nations or economic unions, with Scotland and the UK as leading examples.

***From TTR Issue 11: March 2014***

INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL AND EUROPEAN AFFAIRS

### **Scotland's vote on independence – The implications for Ireland**

by Paul Gillespie

5 February 2014

Link to the article in [English](#)

If Scotland becomes independent, the remaining union between England, Wales and Northern Ireland would be radically disrupted. Should the UK leave the EU, possible following the Conservative Party's commitment to an in/out referendum, the internal turmoil over Scotland would be accompanied by a crisis over the UK's role in Europe. In this paper, Paul Gillespie presents four possible scenarios for how the Scottish independence issue relates to the potential referendum on EU membership and argues that these scenarios raise profoundly important questions for Ireland.

***From TTR Issue 14: June 2014***

EUROPEAN POLICY CENTRE

### **Could an independent Scotland join the European Union?**

by Graham Avery

28 May 2014

Link to the article in [English](#)

The people of Scotland vote in September on the question "Should Scotland be an independent country?". The Scottish Government aims, if the result is 'yes', for Scotland to become independent in March 2016 and to join the main international organisations including the EU. This paper explores the issue from the angle of UK domestic politics as well as Scotland-EU relations.

EUROPEAN POLICY CENTRE / BARCELONA CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS

### **Independentism and the European Union**

by Graham Avery

7 May 2014

Link to the article in [English](#) and in [Catalan](#)

Independentism/separatism is a live issue in Europe today. In the EU separatist parties have gained votes in Scotland, Catalonia, Flanders and elsewhere, and referendums are in prospect. In Eastern Europe Crimea's referendum has led to an international crisis. The author asks what the EU policy on independentism can be, whether the division of a member state into two states is bad for the EU, and finally, how is the organisational structure of the EU fosters independentism.

***From TTR Issue 15: July 2014***

INSTITUTE FOR FISCAL STUDIES

Two papers from the IFS on the potential consequences of independence for taxation, public services, and the welfare system in Scotland. In its [White Paper](#), the Scottish Government sets out tax and spending changes that it argues would lead to a fairer and more economically successful Scotland. The papers draw a mid-term scenario for Scottish public finances, compare per-capita spending in Scotland and the rest of the UK, and make forecasts for Scotland's public deficit.

## **Policies for an independent Scotland? Putting the independence White Paper in its fiscal context**

by David Phillips and Gemma Tetlow  
June 2014  
Link to the article in [English](#)

## **Taxation, government spending and the public finances of Scotland: updating the medium-term outlook**

by David Phillips and Gemma Tetlow  
June 2014  
Link to the article in [English](#)

*From TTR Issue 16 - September 2014*

INSTITUTE FOR FISCAL STUDIES

### **Taxing an independent Scotland**

by Stuart Adam, Paul Johnson and Barra Roantree  
18 August 2014

Link to the article in [English](#)

In this paper we consider the consequences of independence for the optimal design of a new Scottish tax system, an analysis which would also be of some relevance for considering the consequences for tax design of independence of other smaller nations.

FONDATION ROBERT SCHUMAN

### **Scotland's probable choice to remain part of the UK will not necessarily mean the end of the road to autonomy**

by Corinne Deloy  
25 August 2014  
Link to the article in [English](#) and in [French](#)

“Should Scotland be an independent country?”, this is question that 4 million voters living in Scotland will have to answer, with either “yes” or “no” on 18th September (people born in Scotland but not registered on the electoral rolls are not allowed to vote whilst those born in England but living in Scotland will be able to vote) – this affects around 500,000 Britons living in Scotland and 800,000 Scots living in England. Young people aged 16 to 18 are also allowed to vote in this referendum. Unlike the 1997 referendum, there is no minimum turnout threshold required for the validation of this election.

ROYAL UNITED SERVICES INSTITUTE

### **Relocation, relocation, relocation : could the UK's nuclear force be moved after Scottish independence?**

by Hugh Chalmers and Malcolm Chalmers  
August 2014  
Link to the article in [English](#)

A Scottish vote for independence would present a significant challenge to the rest of the UK's nuclear forces, which currently rely upon Scottish bases for operational support. While it is technically feasible that the UK could continue to base its forces in Scotland after its independence, in the long term this option may not be politically feasible. The UK would only seriously consider doing so if the costs of continued Scottish basing were clearly smaller than those of relocating forces to the UK.